

UTT/12/5492/LB – (HIGH EASTER)

(Referred to Committee by Cllr. Hicks Reason To ensure the impact on the listed building is fully considered)

PROPOSAL: Removal of pergola and erection of garden room

LOCATION: 1 Parsonage Farm Barns, Barnston Road, High Easter

APPLICANT: Dr M Beer

AGENT: N/A

GRID REFERENCE: 562403/214986

EXPIRY DATE: 26 December 2012

CASE OFFICER: Miss S Wellard

1.0 NOTATION

1.1 Outside Development Limits, Grade II listed barn

2.0 DESCRIPTION OF SITE

2.1 The application site is a timber framed barn which has an impressive hand made plain clay tiled roof. The structure has been converted into two residential dwellings. No.1 Parsonage Farm Barns, which is the subject of this application, forms a substantial house, which accommodates extensions over two thirds of the main isled barn as well as single storey ranges to the side.

2.2 The dwelling has a large level private amenity space to its rear and western side which is well screened by existing vegetation. There is a large gravelled parking and turning area to the front of the building.

3.0 PROPOSAL

3.1 There is an existing pergola structure located to the rear (northern) elevation of the barn which was granted permission under reference UTT/2150/03/FUL and UTT/2151/03/LB. It is proposed to remove this structure and erect a garden room to this elevation. The proposed structure would have dimensions of 2.3m in depth and 6m in width. At its junction with the barn, it would have a flat roof element that would be situated under the existing guttering which would have a height of 2.6m. This would then change to a mono-pitched roof which would slope upwards with distance from the barn and would have a maximum height of 3.2m. The structure would have an aluminium frame, polyester powder-coated black and would be single-glazed.

4.0 APPLICANTS CASE

4.1 Design and Access Statement (Summary): The design is such that the roofline will not interfere with the roof line of the barn and minimally with the wall. It will have a minimal impact on the appearance of the barn and roof. Materials are in keeping with the barn.

- 4.2. Further Supporting Information received from applicant in response to Conservation Officers comments, 7 December 2012 (Summary): This bespoke design is both elegant and stylish and compliments the barns structure through its black framework and glazing. The clear intent was to avoid a pastiche adornment and to keep and maintain the form of the historic barn distinct from the garden room. The garden room does not detract from the fabric and stance of the barn and in fixing and/or removal does not intrude or impact on the structure. It is more akin to a temporary structure. It is not visible to anyone but ourselves.
- 4.3 The applicants have submitted details as to their interpretation of what occurred at the pre-application meeting, which was attended by the Conservation Officer and by Planning Officer. These views are not the same as those recalled by the Council Officers, who left the meeting expecting further information relating specifically tot his particular building to be submitted as part of the pre-application process, prior to a written response being given.

5.0 RELEVANT SITE HISTORY

- 5.1 UTT/0421/94/LB Amendment to layout of houses 1 and 2 (barn conversion approved under UTT/0876/93/LB). Approved Conditionally. 8th June 1994
- 5.2 UTT/0420/94/FUL Relocation and extension of garage block approved under UTT/0875/93/FUL. Approved Conditionally. 8th June 1994
- 5.3 UTT/0879/97/FUL and UTT/0880/97/LB Installation of metal flue and internal alterations to provide fireplace. Approved Conditionally. 1st October 1997
- 5.4 UTT/0593/98/FUL & UTT/0594/98/LB Erection of greenhouse and shed. Approved Conditionally. 14th August 1998
- 5.5 UTT/0703/98/LB Conversion of loft space to ancillary residential accommodation. Approved Conditionally. 28th July 1998
- 5.6 UTT/1450/98/FUL & UTT/1451/98/LB Conversion of outbuilding to form sunroom and ancillary accommodation. Approved Conditionally. 22nd February 1999
- 5.7 UTT/2150/03/FUL & UTT/2151/03/LB Conversion of storage area into additional living accommodation. Approved Conditionally. 15th April 2004

6.0 POLICIES

6.1 National Policies

- National Planning Policy Framework (2012)

6.2 Uttlesford District Local Plan 2005

- Policy ENV2 Development affecting Listed Buildings
- Policy H6 Conversion of rural buildings to residential use
- Policy GEN2 Design

7.0 PARISH COUNCIL COMMENTS

- 7.1 It is the opinion of the Parish Council that this proposal would be totally out of keeping with the character and appearance of the historic listed barn. If officers are minded to approve this application under delegated powers the Parish Council requests that this application should be determined by the Council's planning committee.

8.0 CONSULTATIONS

ECC Archaeology

- 8.1 The Historic Environment Record shows that the proposed garden room lies within the site of a parsonage (HER 926). The size of the application means that it will not have a significant impact on any surviving archaeological deposits. Therefore no archaeological recommendations are being made on this application.

9.0 REPRESENTATIONS

- 9.1 5 letters of support received;
- The old and new will be sympathetically blended
 - The proposed garden room is unobtrusive and small in scale compared to the existing building.
 - The design looks thoughtful and sympathetic to the surroundings
 - It will have no impact on any neighbours quite enjoyment of their own properties

10.0 APPRAISAL

The issues to consider in the determination of the application are:

- The impact of the proposal on the historic fabric, setting and character of the listed building (UDC Policies H6 and ENV2)

- 10.1 The Council's Conservation Officer has been consulted on the proposal and has made the following comments;

'The Parsonage Barn is timber framed redundant farm building under an impressive hand made plain clay tiled roof. The structure has been converted to two residential units. Number 1 unit subject of this application forms a substantial house, which accommodation extends over 2/3 of the main isled barn as well as single storey ranges to the side.

Saved Local Plan Policy H6 only allows the conversion of rural buildings to residential use if they meet a list of criteria, one of which precludes extensions. In this instance an open small veranda has been approved in the past to shelter the access to the main accommodation from the elements. The aim of the more recent request for pre application advice was to establish acceptability of a slightly larger glasshouse in the same location.

The officers felt that in principle such alternative structure would not in much greater extent detract from the quality of the barn subject to the form of the roof following the roof of approved veranda and not be of mono-pitch shape as presented at the meeting. It was agreed that scaled drawing will be produced for further consideration.

The requested drawings have been submitted as part of the formal application therefore the officers were not given chance to negotiate further.

As predicted at the meeting Officers find the suggested form of the glasshouse unacceptable. The high end of the mono-pitch roof rises above the level of the historic eaves braking up its visual continuity as well as visually impinging on the magnificent tiled roof when viewed directly from the garden. In addition the side elevations would produce an unsightly detail with the new roof slanting up, contrary to the flow of the historic roof. I consider that apart of the visual architectural discomfort, the unfortunate hidden gutter would collect debris further contributing to the inapt and messy detail. Consequently I suggest refusal of this application'.

10.2 In line with these comments, it is considered that the proposed structure would have a significantly detrimental impact on the appearance and character of the listed building. The roof form would impinge on views of the barn and its historic roof form, severing its visual continuity. The slant of the roof is at odds with the historic roof form, detracting from its traditional form and appearance.

10.3 The applicant has stated that the structure is more akin to a temporary structure, however is it not proposed to be removed after a temporary period and would be attached to the building. It is an extension to the barn.

11.0 CONCLUSION

The following is a summary of the main reasons for the recommendation:

- The proposed structure would have a significantly detrimental impact on the appearance and character of the listed building. The roof form would impinge on views of the barn and its historic roof form, severing its visual continuity. The slant of the roof is at odds with the historic roof form, detracting from its traditional form and appearance. As such, the proposal is contrary to the requirements of Policies H6 and ENV2 of the Uttlesford Local Plan (adopted 2005) and guidance contained in the National Planning Policy Framework (2012).

RECOMMENDATION – REFUSAL

The proposed structure would have a significantly detrimental impact on the appearance and character of the listed building. The roof form would impinge on views of the barn and its historic roof form, severing its visual continuity. The slant of the roof is at odds with the historic roof form, detracting from its traditional form and appearance. As such, the proposal is contrary to the requirements of Policies H6 and ENV2 of the Uttlesford Local Plan (adopted 2005) and guidance contained in the National Planning Policy Framework (2012).
